## Response

# Common variable immunodeficiency patients with increased CD21<sup>-/lo</sup> B cells suffer from altered receptor editing and defective central B-cell tolerance

The letter by Rakhmanov et al<sup>1</sup> suggested that normal  $\kappa/\lambda$  ratios in CD21<sup>+</sup> naive B cells and increased Ig $\lambda$ -chain usage by CD21<sup>-/Io</sup> B cells in common variable immunodeficiency disease (CVID) patients with expanded CD21<sup>-/Io</sup> B-cell populations (CVID group-Ia<sup>2</sup>) were evidence of normal or increased receptor editing during central selection. Although increased Ig $\lambda$ -chain usage could correlate with extensive secondary recombination because Ig $\lambda$  genes normally rearrange after Ig $\kappa$  genes, the best evidence of receptor editing and central tolerance defects is found in proximal B-cell

populations, specifically immature B cells in marrow or new emigrant/transitional B cells in peripheral blood. These subpopulations, similar in antibody repertoire and reactivity, offer an accurate historical record of central events uninfluenced by proliferation.<sup>3,4</sup> Accordingly, the analysis by Warnatz and colleagues<sup>1</sup> of Ig $\lambda$ -chain usage in CD21<sup>+</sup> naive B cells and CD21<sup>-/Io</sup> B cells from 4 CVID group-Ia patients does not inform central events but implies peripheral selection in 2 B-cell subpopulations with well-documented histories of homeostatic expansion.<sup>4,5</sup> Therefore, we



Figure 1. Diminished secondary recombination and corresponding defective central tolerance in the new emigrant/transitional B cells of CVID group-la patients. (A) Receptor editing is mediated by successive rounds of secondary recombination catalyzed by RAG enzymes with replacement of existing Igk gene rearrangements with newly joined upstream V  $\kappa$  and downstream J  $\kappa$ gene segments. Increased Jk1 (B) combined to decreased upstream  $V\kappa\left(C\right)$  gene segment usage in the new emigrant/transitional B cells of CVID group-la patients reveals a unique repertoire niche (D) reflecting a history of decreased secondary recombination compared with healthy controls and non-group-Ia CVID patients. (E) An increased frequency of polyreactive new emigrant B cells in CVID group-la patients compared with healthy controls demonstrates a central defect in B-cell tolerance in these patients. Each diamond represents an individual, and the average is shown with a bar.

assessed if receptor editing is functional in CVID group-Ia patients by analyzing the antibody repertoire and reactivity of new emigrant/ transitional B cells from these patients.

We report here the Igk repertoire from 1226 single CD19+CD10++IgMhiCD27- new emigrant/transitional B cells from 49 individuals including 21 healthy controls, 11 CVID group-Ia patients and 17 CVID non group-Ia patients with CD21<sup>-/lo</sup> B cells < 20% of total B cells.<sup>2</sup> Secondary recombination mediating receptor editing replaces previous Igk gene rearrangements with variable  $(V\kappa)$ -joining  $(J\kappa)$  gene segment joints resulting in increased Vk genes located upstream of the locus combined to downstream Jk genes (Figure 1A).<sup>6</sup> We found that the Igk repertoires of new emigrant/transitional B cells from CVID group-Ia patients were biased toward Jk1, the most upstream Jk gene segment, suggesting decreased secondary recombination (Figure 1B). CVID group-Ia Igk repertoires were also characterized by decreased usage of upstream Vk segments, genes overrepresented in diseases marked by extensive secondary recombination (Figure 1C).<sup>7,8</sup> Moreover, bivariate analysis of Jk1 and upstream Vk usage further demonstrated CVID group-Ia new emigrant/transitional B cells occupy a distinct Igk repertoire niche reflecting a dearth of secondary recombination (Figure 1D). The molecular basis of secondary recombination defects in these patients remains unknown and its correlation with the presence of peripheral CD21<sup>-/lo</sup> B cells is not understood. One clue about the regulation of secondary recombination came from BTK-deficient patients who display impaired B-cell receptor (BCR) signaling correlating with extensive secondary recombination events potentially through a failure to down-regulate RAG gene expression.7 Increased BCR signaling might therefore induce the premature RAG gene downregulation resulting in the diminished secondary recombination activity observed in CVID group-Ia patients. This hypothesis, however, is not supported by BCR-induced calcium flux data demonstrating normal signal strength in CD21<sup>+</sup> mature naive B cells from such patients.<sup>5,9</sup> Alternatively, decreased recombination events in CVID group-Ia Igk repertoires may suggest defective V(D)J recombination and/or DNA repair. The presence of such defects may account for radiosensitivity and malignancy susceptibility reported in some CVID patients.10

Finally, using an RT-PCR method to clone and express in vitro antibodies express by single B cells,<sup>3</sup> we found that CVID group-Ia patients displayed increased frequencies of polyreactive clones in their new emigrant/transitional B-cell compartment, demonstrating a defective central B-cell tolerance checkpoint in these individuals (Figure 1E). Hence, the altered regulation of secondary recombination/receptor editing in developing B cells from CVID group-Ia patients correlates with the impaired counterselection of autoreactive clones in their bone marrow.

#### Neil Romberg

Department of Pediatrics, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT

#### Yen-Shing Ng

Department of Immunobiology, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT

Charlotte Cunningham-Rundles

Department of Medicine and Pediatrics, Mount Sinai Medical Center, New York, NY

#### Eric Meffre

Department of Immunobiology, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT

N. R. and Y.-S. N. contributed equally to this work.

Acknowledgments: The authors thank Dr S. Rudchenko and S. Semova for cell sorting. This work was supported by Grant Number T32 Al007174 and CIS/Talecris Fellowship Award (to N.R.), Al061093, Al071087 and Al082713 from National Institutes of Health-National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases (to E.M.).

Contribution: N. R., Y.-S. N., and E. M. performed research and analyzed data; C.C.-R. and E. M. designed the study; and N. R. and E. M. wrote the letter.

**Conflict-of-interest disclosure:** C.C.R. has served on the medical advisory board of Baxter Therapeutics and has received research grants from Baxter Therapeutics and Octapharma. The remaining authors declare no competing financial interests.

Correspondence: Eric Meffre, Yale University School of Medicine, 300 George St, New Haven, CT 06520; e-mail: eric.meffre@yale.edu.

### References

- Rakhmanov M, Gutenberger S, Keller B, Schlesier M, Peter HH, and Warnatz K. CD21low B cells in common variable immunodeficiency do not show defects in receptor editing, but resemble tissue-like memory B cells. *Blood.* 2010;116(18): 3682-3683.
- Warnatz K, Denz A, Dräger R, et al. Severe deficiency of switched memory B cells (CD27(+)IgM(-)IgD(-)) in subgroups of patients with common variable immunodeficiency: a new approach to classify a heterogeneous disease. *Blood.* 2002;99(5):1544-1551.
- Wardemann H, Yurasov S, Schaefer A, Young JW, Meffre E, and Nussenzweig MC. Predominant autoantibody production by early human B-cell precursors. *Science*. 2003;301(5638):1374-1377.
- van Zelm MC, Szczepanski T, van der Burg M and van Dongen JJ. Replication history of B lymphocytes reveals homeostatic proliferation and extensive antigen-induced B-cell expansion. J Exp Med. 2007;204(3):645-655.
- Rakhmanov M, Keller B, Gutenberger S, et al. Circulating CD21low B cells in common variable immunodeficiency resemble tissue homing, innate-like B cells. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. 2009;106(32):13451-13456.
- Prak EL and Weigert M. Light chain replacement: a new model for antibody gene rearrangement. J Exp Med. 1995;182(2):541-548.
- Ng YS., Wardemann H, Chelnis J, Cunningham-Rundles C and Meffre E. Bruton's tyrosine kinase is essential for human B-cell tolerance. J Exp Med. 2004;200(7):927-934.
- Samuels J, Ng YS., Coupillaud C, Paget D and Meffre E. Impaired early B-cell tolerance in patients with rheumatoid arthritis. *J Exp Med.* 2005;201(10):1659-1667.
- Isnardi I, Ng YS, Menard L, et al. Complement receptor 2/CD21- human naive B cells contain mostly autoreactive unresponsive clones. *Blood.* 2010;115(24): 5026-5036.
- Offer SM, Pan-Hammarstrom Q, Hammarstrom L and Harris RS. Unique DNA repair gene variations and potential associations with the primary antibody deficiency syndromes IgAD and CVID. *PLoS One*. 2010;5(8):e12260.