

A role for interleukin-12/23 in the maturation of human natural killer and CD56⁺ T cells in vivo

Sophie Guia,¹⁻³ Céline Cognet,¹⁻⁴ Ludovic de Beaucoudrey,^{5,6} Marlowe S. Tessmer,⁷ Emmanuelle Jouanguy,^{5,6} Claire Berger,⁸ Orchidée Filipe-Santos,^{5,6} Jacqueline Feinberg,^{5,6} Yildiz Camcioglu,⁹ Jacob Levy,¹⁰ Suliman Al Jumaah,¹¹ Sami Al-Hajjar,¹¹ Jean-Louis Stephan,⁸ Claire Fieschi,¹² Laurent Abel,^{5,6} Laurent Brossay,⁷ Jean-Laurent Casanova,^{5,6,13} and Eric Vivier¹⁻⁴

¹Centre d'Immunologie de Marseille-Luminy, Université de la Méditerranée, Marseille, France; ²Inserm U631, Marseille, France; ³Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), UMR6102, Marseille, France; ⁴Hôpital de la Conception, Assistance Publique–Hôpitaux de Marseille, Marseille, France; ⁵Laboratoire de Génétique Humaine des Maladies Infectieuses, Inserm U550, Paris, France; ⁶Université Paris René Descartes, Faculté de Médecine Necker, Paris, France; ⁷Department of Molecular Microbiology and Immunology, Brown University, Providence, RI; ⁸Service de Pédiatrie, Centre Hospitalier Universitaire (CHU), St Etienne, France; ⁹Department of Pediatrics, Infectious Diseases, Clinical Immunology and Allergy Division, Cerrahpaçsa Medical School, Istanbul University, Istanbul, Turkey; ¹⁰Pediatric Department, Soroka Medical Center, Faculty of Health Sciences, Ben Gurion University, Beer Sheva, Israel; ¹¹Department of Pediatrics, King Faysal Hospital and Research Center, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia; ¹²Service d'Immunopathologie, Hôpital Saint-Louis, Paris, France; and ¹³Unité d'Immuno-Hématologie, Hôpital Necker, Paris, France

Natural killer (NK) cells have been originally defined by their "naturally occurring" effector function. However, only a fraction of human NK cells is reactive toward a panel of prototypical tumor cell targets in vitro, both for the production of interferon- γ (IFN- γ) and for their cytotoxic response. In patients with *IL12RB1* mutations that lead to a complete IL-12R β 1 deficiency, the size of this naturally reactive NK cell subset is diminished, in particular for the IFN- γ production. Similar data were obtained from a patient with a complete deficit in IL-12p40. In addition, the size of the subset of effector memory T cells expressing CD56 was severely decreased in IL-12R β 1– and IL-12p40– deficient patients. Human NK cells thus require in vivo priming with IL-12/23 to acquire their full spectrum of functional reactivity, while T cells are dependent upon IL-12/23 signals for the differentiation and/or the maintenance of CD56+ effector memory T cells. The susceptibil-

ity of IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients to *Mycobacterium* and *Salmonella* infections in combination with the absence of mycobacteriosis or salmonellosis in the rare cases of human NK cell deficiencies point to a role for CD56⁺ T cells in the control of these infections in humans. (Blood. 2008;111:5008-5016)

© 2008 by The American Society of Hematology

Introduction

Natural killer (NK) cells have been initially described as non-T, non-B lymphocytes that are "naturally" elicited to mediate their effector functions (ie, cytotoxicity and cytokine production) without prior sensitization.¹ Both arms of NK cell effector functions participate in the direct innate defense and in the shaping of the adaptive immune response.² In several mouse models, NK cells limit the development of tumors and microbial infections.³⁻⁵ In particular, NK cells control the early steps of mouse cytomegalovirus (MCMV) infection, both by directly killing virus-infected cells and by producing IFN- γ .⁶

The natural acquisition of NK cell effector function has recently been challenged through the demonstration that only a minor fraction of circulating human NK cells or splenic mouse NK cells is reactive toward prototypical NK cell targets in single-cell assays.⁷⁻¹³ It is thus becoming increasingly clear that NK cells are following various steps of maturation, culminating into the final effector stage.¹⁰⁻¹⁵ In mice, the production of interleukin (IL)–15 by dendritic cells is one of the factors that primes naive NK cells into effectors.^{9,13}

These results suggest that the fraction of NK cells that qualifies as effectors in vitro corresponds to the NK cells that had been exposed to in vivo priming prior to the in vitro assays. This hypothesis prompted us to determine the host genetic factors that contribute to NK cell reactivity in humans. We focused our interest on the IL-12 family of cytokines, as IL-12 had been initially identified on the basis of its ability to enhance NK cell cytotoxicity and interferon- γ (IFN- γ) production.¹⁶⁻¹⁹ A number of studies have indeed demonstrated that IL-12 affects NK cell effector function,²⁰⁻²³ especially with respect to NK cell activation by dendritic cells. IL-12 (IL-12p40:IL-12p35) and IL-23 (IL-12p40:IL-23p19) are structurally related heterodimeric cytokines that regulate cellmediated immune responses and Th1-type inflammatory reactions. 24 The IL-12 receptor is composed of 2 chains, IL-12R $\beta 1$ and IL-12R β 2, the former being also part of the IL-23R.²⁴ In mice, numerous studies have shown a critical role for IL-12 in protective immunity to various pathogens.²⁵ In contrast, the description of human patients with inherited IL-12 or IL-12R deficiencies has revealed that IL-12 is redundant for human defense against most

The online version of this article contains a data supplement.

The publication costs of this article were defrayed in part by page charge payment. Therefore, and solely to indicate this fact, this article is hereby marked "advertisement" in accordance with 18 USC section 1734.

© 2008 by The American Society of Hematology

Submitted November 14, 2007; accepted February 20, 2008. Prepublished online as *Blood* First Edition paper, March 4, 2008; DOI 10.1182/blood-2007-11-122259.

Table 1. Patient characteristics

Patient	Age, y	Sex	Onset	Mutations	Historical clinic status	Experimental time clinic status
1*	25	F	Morocco	IL12RB1 K305X	BCGite + Salmonella	Salmonella suspicion
2*†	34	F	France	[<i>IL12RB1</i> 1745]-1746insCA+1483+182-1619-1073del	BCGite + Salmonella	Asymptomatic
3*	4	F	France	IL12RB1 Q32X	BCGite	Asymptomatic
4*	16	F	Belgium	IL12RB1 Q32X	Asymptomatic	Asymptomatic
5	11	М	Turkey	IL12RB1 R173P	Salmonella	Asymptomatic
6*	6	М	Israel	IL12RB1 700+362-1619-944del	Salmonella	Asymptomatic
7	9	М	Saudi Arabia	<i>IL12RB1</i> 1190-1G>A	BCGite + Salmonella	Salmonella
8	13	М	Saudi Arabia	<i>IL12RB1</i> 1190-1G>A	Salmonella	Salmonella
9	5	М	Tunisia	IL12 297del8	Salmonella	Salmonella + asymptomatic

Indicated IL-12R β 1- or IL-12p40-deficient patients (n = 9, 13.7 ± 10 years old, M/F ratio: 5:4) were analyzed in comparison with healthy control individuals (n = 16, 26.1 ± 12.0 years old, M/F ratio: 4:12 for the phenotypic analysis; n = 13, 29.5 ± 8.4 years old, M/F ratio: 3:10 for the functional analysis).

*The patients P1, P2, P3, P4, and P6 were previously described in Fieschi et al²⁷ as 1.II.2, 19.II.1, 20.II.1, 21.II., and 10.II.1, respectively.

†The patient contracted hepatitis C virus (HCV) after a blood transfusion.

microorganisms.²⁶⁻³⁰ Noticeable exceptions include *Mycobacterium*, such as environmental *Mycobacterium*, BCG vaccines, and *M tuberculosis*, as well as *Salmonella* infections, which critically depend on IL-12/23.^{26,27} Overall, patients with mutations in molecules involved in the IFN- γ /IL-12/23–dependent pathway are affected by the syndrome of Mendelian susceptibility to mycobacterial disease (MSMD).^{26,27,30,31} This syndrome is biologically characterized by deeply impaired or absent IFN- γ production or function, and is clinically defined by the susceptibility to mycobacteriosis and salmonellosis. Here, we analyzed the phenotypic and functional features of circulating NK and NK-like CD56⁺ T cells in a group of 9 patients who present a complete IL-12R β 1 or IL-12p40 deficiency.

Methods

Patients and controls

Peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMCs) were isolated by Ficoll-Hypaque density gradient centrifugation (GE Healthcare, Little Chalfont, United Kingdom) from whole blood samples obtained from healthy volunteer donors, and IL-12R β 1– and IL-12p40–deficient patients described in Table 1. These human studies were performed and informed consent from all participating subjects was obtained in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki.

Reagents

The following monoclonal antibodies (mAbs) were used: PE-conjugated anti-CD16 (mouse IgG1, 3G8), anti-CD25 (IgG2a, B1.49.9), anti-CD62L (IgG1, Dreg 56), anti-CD94 (IgG2a, HP-3B1), anti-CD158a,h (IgG1, EB6), anti-CD158b1/b2/j (IgG1, GL183), anti-CD158e1 (IgG1, Z27), anti-CD158i (IgG2a, FESTR172), anti-CD161 (IgG2a, 191B8), anti-NKp30 (IgG1, Z25), anti-NKp44 (IgG1, Z231), anti-NKp46 (IgG1, Bab281), anti-NKG2A (IgG2b, Z199); FITC-conjugated anti-CD3 (IgG1, UCHT1); PECy5-conjugated anti-CD56 (IgG1, NKH-1); APC-conjugated anti-CD56 (NKH-1; Beckman Coulter Immunotech, Marseille, France); PE-conjugated anti-CD69 (IgG1, FN50), antiperforin (IgG2b, 27-35), anti-IFN-y (IgG1, 4S-B3); FITC-conjugated anti-CD107a (IgG1, H4A5), anti-CD107b (IgG1, H4B4); PerCP-Cy5.5-conjugated anti-CD3 (IgG1, SK7; Becton Dickinson, Lincoln Park, NJ); purified anti-IL-12 (IgG1, 24910; R&D Systems, Minneapolis, MN), biotin-conjugated anti-CD162R (IgM, 5H10; Innate Pharma, Marseille, France); and PE-labeled streptavidin (Southern-Biotechnology Associated, Birmingham, AL). Human recombinant IL-12 (219-IL) and IL-23 (1290-IL) were purchased from R&D Systems; human IL-2 (Proleukin), from Chiron (Emeryville, CA); human IL-15(200-15), from Peprotech (Rocky Hill, NJ); and human IL-18 (B003-5), from MBL (Watertown, MA).

NK cell analysis

PBMCs were analyzed by 3-color flow cytometry using a FACSCalibur cytometer (Becton Dickinson). NK cells were defined as CD3-CD56+ cells within the lymphocyte gate. Natural cytotoxicity was assessed using the MHC class I⁻ human erythroleukemic K562 target cells, as well as fibroblastic hamster CHO and human HeLa target cells. Antibodydependent cell cytotoxicity (ADCC) was assessed using the P815 mouse mastocytoma cells coated with rabbit antimouse lymphocyte antibodies (Accurate Biochemicals, Westbury, NY). NK cell effector functions were tested in a single-cell assay using CD107 mobilization and IFN-y production, as previously described.7 In these assays, PBMCs were incubated for 4 hours at 37°C in the presence of GolgiStop (1/1500; Becton Dickinson), anti-CD107 mAb, and various stimuli. The effector-target ratio was 2.5:1. Cells were then washed in PBS supplemented with 2% FCS, 1 mM EDTA and stained for 30 minutes at 4°C with PerCP-Cy5.5-conjugated anti-CD3, APC-conjugated anti-CD56, and normal mouse serum 2%. After fixation in paraformaldehyde 2% and permeabilization (PermWash; Becton Dickinson), the expression of IFN- γ was detected by incubation with PEconjugated anti-IFN-y for 30 minutes at 4°C. As a negative control, species- and isotype-matched control mAbs were used for all stainings.

Generation of IL-2-activated NK cells

NK cell–enriched PBMCs were obtained using the RosetteSep Human NK Cell kit (StemCell Technologies, Vancouver, BC). Then, NK cells were resuspended in RPMI 10% FCS containing human IL-2 at 100 U/mL and PHA (Invitrogen, Frederick, MD) at 10 μ g/mL in 96-well U-bottom plate. For expansion, NK cells needed previously irradiated (50 gray) allogeneic PBMCs at the concentration 2 \times 10⁶ cells/mL. Every 2 days, the medium was replaced by RPMI 10% FCS supplemented with IL-2 100 U/mL.

Whole-blood activation by live BCG

Venous blood samples of healthy donors were collected into heparinized tubes. Blood (500 μ L) was dispensed into wells of a 6-well plate for a final volume of 1 mL/well (dilution with RPMI 1640 supplemented with 100 U/mL penicillin and 100 μ /mL streptomycin). The diluted blood sample then incubated in a 2-stage procedure during 24 and 48 hours at 37°C in an atmosphere containing 5% CO₂ and under 3 conditions of activation: with medium alone, with live bacillus Calmette-Guerin (*M bovis* BCG, Pasteur substrain) at an MOI of 20 BCG/leukocytes,³² and with BCG plus IL12 (20 ng/mL; R&D Systems). Six hours before the end of activation, GolgiStop (1/1500; Becton Dickinson) was added in each well. The production of IFN- γ was detected by intracellular staining as described in "NK cell analysis" and analyzed by flow cytometry.

Statistical analysis

Graphic representation and statistical analysis of NK cell distribution were performed using GraphPad Prism software (GraphPad Software, San



Diego, CA). Comparison of distributions was performed using Mann Whitney test. **P* was less than .05; ***P* was less than .01; ns indicates not significant. The statistical analysis never included the IL-12p40^{-/-} patient together with the IL-12R β 1^{-/-} patients. Age-matched statistical analysis was performed as described in Table 1 (L.A.).

Results

NK cell phenotype in IL-12R_β1–deficient patients

The role of IL-12 and IL-23 on human NK cells in vivo was first tested by analyzing circulating NK cell counts in a cohort of IL-12R β 1-deficient patients presenting a complete IL-12R β 1 deficiency (Table 1). Normal PBMC counts have been previously reported in a large cohort of IL-12Rβ1-deficient patients.²⁷ No alteration in the percentage CD3-CD56+ NK cells within PBMCs was detected here in our cohort of 8 IL-12RB1-deficient patients (Figure 1A). Human NK cells can be divided in 2 reciprocal subsets, based on the cell surface expression of CD56. CD56^{bright} NK cells represent a minority of blood NK cells, but are prominent in secondary lymphoid organs.33 CD56bright NK cells readily produce IFN- γ in response to proinflammatory cytokines such as IL-12, IL-18, and IL-15.7,34 In contrast, most circulating NK cells have a CD56^{dim} phenotype; they initiate their cytolytic and cytokine production programs upon interaction with tumor cell targets.7 No difference between the size of the CD56^{bright} and $CD56^{dim}$ NK cell subsets was detected when control and IL-12R β 1deficient patients were compared (data not shown). The NK cell surface phenotype of IL-12RB1-deficient patients was also indistinguishable from that of control individuals, for the expression of MHC class I-specific receptors (killer cell Ig-like receptors: CD158/KIR, CD94, CD159a/NKG2A), of a panel of activating and cell adhesion receptors (CD16, CD161/NKR-P1, CD162R/PEN5, CD62L/L-selectin) as well as of NK cell activation markers (CD25 and CD69). Importantly, the intracytoplasmic NK cell content in perforin was comparable between control and IL-12RB1-deficient individuals (Figure 1B). In control individuals, CD56^{bright} NK cells expressed slightly lower cell surface levels of NKp30 and higher levels of NKp46 than CD56dim NK cells (Figure S1A, available on the Blood website; see the Supplemental Materials link at the top of the online article). In IL-12RB1-deficient patients, a slight decrease in NKp30 cell surface density was observed mainly on CD56dim NK cells (Figure S1A,B). A minor down-regulation of NKp46 expression was also observed (Figure S1B), but this trend did not reach statistical significance. Thus, circulating NK cells did not present gross abnormalities in counts or in their phenotype, including the repertoire of MHC class I receptors, showing that IL-12 and IL-23 are dispensable for the phenotypic development of human NK cells in vivo.

NK cell effector functions in IL-12Rβ1–deficient patients

We then analyzed NK cell effector functions using single-cell assays. We quantified the IFN- γ production and the cytotoxicity

Figure 1. Normal NK cellularity and phenotype in IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients. (A) The percentages of NK cells present in peripheral blood of indicated individuals were computed from the percentages of CD3⁻CD56⁺ cells within the lymphocyte. Each dot indicates the value obtained from one individual. (B) Circulating NK cells from indicated individuals were explored for their cell surface phenotype (except for perforin, where an intracytoplasmic staining was performed). Each dot indicates the value obtained from one individual.

potential (via the CD107 degranulation assay), using peripheral blood NK cells from patients and control individuals, in response to a panel of tumor cell lines. The response of patients' NK cells to the prototypical MHC class I⁻ tumor cell target K562 was diminished compared with control individuals (Figure 2A). The reduction in NK cell response was more pronounced for IFN- γ production than for the CD107 degranulation assay, as only the former reached statistical significance in these experimental settings (Figure 2B).



Figure 2. NK cell hyporesponsiveness in IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients. (A) A representative experiment comparing the in vitro reactivity of NK cells from healthy control individuals and IL-12R β 1-deficient patients is shown. PBMCs were incubated for 4 hours in the presence or absence of K562 cells and assessed for CD107 and IFN- γ expression. (B) PBMCs prepared from a cohort of healthy control individuals, IL-12R β 1-deficient patients and one IL-12P40-deficient patient were analyzed for their NK reactivity in the presence of indicated tumor cells; ADCC: antibody-coated P815 cells. Values indicate mean plus or minus SD. Each dot represents the data obtained from one individual.

A trend toward a decrease in NK cell effector function (both IFN- γ production and degranulation) was also observed in response to 2 other tumor cell lines (CHO and HeLa), as well as upon antibody-dependent cell cytotoxicity (ADCC) challenge (Figure 2B). It is likely that the small size of our cohort of IL-12RB1deficient patients was responsible for the fact that the decrease in NK cell reactivity did not reach statistical significance. K562, HeLa, and CHO cells are recognized by a combination of NK cell receptors including NKp30 (data not shown). However, the slight decrease in NKp30 expression observed in patients' NK cells was unlikely to be solely responsible for the decreased NK cell reactivity observed with IL-12RB1-deficient cells. Indeed, the ADCC response of IL-12RB1-deficient NK cells followed the same trend, but is CD16 dependent and NCR independent. In addition, no correlation could be found between the extent of NKp30 down-regulation and the reduced reactivity observed with NK cells from IL-12R_β1-deficient patients (data not shown). Therefore our data rather suggest that signaling via IL-12RB1 partially controls critical transduction components that are downstream of and common to various NK cell activating pathways. Patients included in this study were symptomatic or asymptomatic (Table 1), and no correlation between the decrease in IFN- γ production upon K562 stimulation and the clinical status could be established (data not shown).

NK cells in an IL-12p40–deficient patient

We further tested the role of IL-12RB1-dependent signals on NK cells by analyzing the reactivity of circulating NK cells isolated from a patient presenting a genetic deficiency in IL-12p40 (IL12B). NK cells from the IL-12p40-deficient patient were hyporesponsive to K562 and ADCC challenge (Figure 3). The IL-12p40-deficient patient was tested under symptomatic and asymptomatic conditions, and no correlation between the decrease in NK cell reactivity and the clinical status was detected (data not shown). As for IL-12Rβ1-deficient patients, no gross abnormalities in circulating NK cell counts and phenotype were observed in the IL-12p40deficient patient (Figure 1A,B closed triangles). The lack of other IL-12p40-deficient patients available prevented us from analyzing whether the intensity of the NK cell defect was different in IL-12p40- and IL-12Rβ1-deficient patients. Nevertheless, the NK cell hyporesponsiveness in both the IL-12p40– and the IL-12R β 1– deficient patients strongly advocates for a role of IL-12/23 in the acquisition NK cell effector function (ie, in NK cell priming in vivo



Figure 4. Differential role of IL-12 and IL-23 on IFN- γ production by NK cells in vitro. PBMCs prepared from healthy control individuals were cultured for 4 hours in vitro with the indicated concentrations of human recombinant IL-12 or IL-23, and then assayed for IFN- γ production. Results are expressed as mean plus or minus SD of 3 independent experiments.

in humans). In contrast to IL-12,²⁵ we could not detect a significant in vitro effect of IL-23 treatment on healthy NK cell IFN- γ production (Figure 4), suggesting that the decrease in NK cell IFN- γ production in IL-12R β 1–deficient patients was due to IL-12 rather than IL-23.

Role of IL-12 in NK cell priming

We then tested whether IL-12 was required during the contact between NK cells present in PBMCs and the tumor cell target or whether IL-12 was one of the factors that contributes to human NK cell priming in vivo. As shown in Figure 5, the addition of a blocking anti–IL-12 mAb during the 4-hour incubation between healthy PBMCs and K562 target cells did not influence NK cell response. The NK cell defect observed in IL-12R β 1–deficient patients was thus most likely not the consequence of a role for IL-12 during the 4-hour in vitro assay, but resulted from a role of IL-12 in vivo prior to the isolation of peripheral blood cells.

Complementation of IL-12-dependent NK cell defects

To further address the role of IL-12 in NK cell function, PBMCs prepared from the IL-12p40–deficient patient and IL-12R β 1– deficient patients were treated in vitro with recombinant human IL-12, and the reactivity of NK cells to K562 was assessed. Exogenous IL-12 complemented the defect in NK IFN- γ production of the IL-12p40–deficient patient, but not of IL-12R β 1– deficient patients, as expected (Figure 6A). By contrast, no



0 K562 K562 + anti IL-12 mAb IL-12 IL-12 + anti IL-12 mAb 2 4 6 8 10 12 0 IFN-v⁺ NK cells 0 K562 K562 + anti IL-12 mAb II -12 IL-12 + anti IL-12 mAb 2 4 6 8 10 12 0 CD107⁺ NK cells

Figure 3. NK cell hyporesponsiveness in an IL-12p40–deficient patient. A representative experiment comparing the in vitro reactivity of NK cells from one control individual and one IL-12p40–deficient patient is shown. PBMCs were incubated for 4 hours in the presence or absence of K562 cells and assessed for CD107 and IFN- γ expression.





Figure 6. Complementation of the IL-12–dependent NK cell hyporesponsiveness. (A) PBMCs from one representative control individual, one representative IL-12Rβ1–deficient patient, and one IL-12P40–deficient patient were cultured for 24 hours in vitro with human recombinant IL-12 (1 ng/mL), and then assayed for IFN-γ production in response to 4-hour K562 stimulation. Results are expressed as the percentage of IFN- γ^+ NK cells in patients normalized to the percentage of IFN- γ^+ NK cells in the control individual (set to 100%). (B) NK cell cultures of indicated origin (healthy controls, IL-12Rβ– and IL-12P40–deficient patients) were generated by incubating NK cells or IL-2–cultured NK cells of the same individuals were then compared in parallel in a 4-hour K562 stimulation.

difference in the reactivity to K562 was observed in IL-2–cultured NK cells from control, IL-12p40–deficient, and IL-12R β 1–deficient patients (Figure 6B), showing that IL-12 played a redundant role in the priming of NK cells, when grown in IL-2.

Lack of CD56⁺ T cells in IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients

During their maturation, T cells can acquire some NK cell attributes, such as the cell surface expression of NK cell receptors.³⁵ In contrast to the lack of major NK cell phenotypic alteration in IL-12/23 axis–deficient patients, the size of the subset of T cells that expresses CD56 was severely reduced in both IL-12R β 1– and

IL-12p40-deficient patients (Figure 7A,B). The small size of the subset of CD56⁺ T cells in patients prevented us from precisely analyzing their functional characteristics in great detail. Nevertheless, in control individuals CD56⁺ T cells were mainly CD8⁺ T cells, whereas a few consisted of Va24 invariant NKT cells and $\gamma\delta$ T cells (data not shown). The low fraction of invariant V α 24⁺ T cells in CD56⁺ T cells (from 1% to 5% of CD56⁺ T cells) is consistent with previous results,36 and makes it unlikely to be responsible for the drastic reduction in the size of the CD56⁺ T-cell subset in IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients (from $4.2\% \pm 2.6\%$ to $1.6\% \pm 1.5\%$ of total lymphocytes in control individuals vs patients, respectively, Figure 7B). In control individuals, CD56+ T cells also included a substantial fraction of T cells expressing other NK cell phenotypic features such as KIR, CD94/NKG2A, and CD161 (Figure 8A). CD56 surface expression on T cells correlated with high intracytoplasmic perforin content (Figure 8A), consistent with previous results.³⁷ Importantly, CD56⁺ T cells were not only equipped as cytolytic effectors, but they also shared with NK cells the capacity to produce IFN- γ upon IL-12 + IL-18 treatment,³⁸ and to a lesser extent upon IL-15 stimulation (ie, in absence of TCR engagement; Figure 8B). In addition, a substantial fraction of NK cells and CD56⁺ T cells, but barely detectable CD56⁻ T cells, produced IFN- γ in vitro in presence of live BCG (Figure 8C) and in response to Salmonella typhimurium-infected macrophages (N. Lapaque and J. Trowsdale, personal communication, December 17, 2007). The IL-12/23 axis deficiency was also associated with a lower expression of CD161 on CD56⁺ T cells. Since the size of the CD56⁺ T-cell subset increases with aging and most of the IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients comprised infants and young adults,³⁹ a careful statistical analysis was conducted to find out whether age had a confounding effect on our results. However, the restriction of the cohort of healthy control individuals to age-matched patients still revealed a statistically significant reduction in the size of the CD56+ T-cell subsets in IL-12/23-deficient patients (data not shown). Thus, IL-12/23 was mandatory for the expansion of a subset of T cells, mainly CD8⁺, that presents features shared by both NK cells and effector memory T cells: cell surface expression of CD56, intracytoplasmic expression of perforin, and IFN- γ production in response to IL-12 + IL-18. IL-12/23 was critical for the final CD8⁺ T-cell maturation steps and/or for the maintenance of this CD56⁺ T-cell subset in PBMCs.

Discussion

IL-12 and IL-23 are cytokines that represent a functional bridge between the early resistance and the subsequent antigen-specific adaptive immunity.^{24,26,32,40} Here we have shown that IL-12/23 was



Figure 7. Reduced size of the CD56⁺ T-cell subset in IL-12/23 axis–deficient patients. (A,B) The percentages of CD56⁺ T cells present in peripheral blood of indicated individuals were computed within the total lymphocyte gate. Each dot represents the value obtained from one individual (B).



Figure 8. Altered T-cell phenotype in IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients. (A) Circulating CD56⁺ T cells (top panel) and CD56⁻ T cells (bottom panel) from indicated individuals were explored for their cell surface phenotype (except for perforin, where an intracytoplasmic staining was performed). Each dot indicates the value obtained from one individual. (B) Circulating CD56⁻ T cells, CD56⁺ T cells, and NK cells from 4 representative healthy control individuals were assayed for their IFN-γ production in response to 24-hour treatment in the presence or absence of indicated cytokines: IL-2 (50 U/mL), IL-15 (10 ng/mL), IL-18 (20 ng/mL), IL-12 (5 ng/mL). (C) Circulating CD56⁻ T cells, CD56⁺ T cells, and NK cells from 5 healthy individuals were assayed for their IFN-γ production in response to live BCG alone or BCG plus IL-12 (20 ng/mL) during 24 and 48 hours. Each line represents the response obtained with one individual.

differentially required by 2 subsets of effector lymphocytes in vivo in humans: NK cells and CD56⁺ T cells. While acting on NK cells as a priming factor, IL-12/23 was required for the differentiation and/or the maintenance of CD56⁺ effector memory T cells.

Previous observations had revealed that NK cells were present in normal numbers in IL-12RB1-deficient patients.^{21,41} We confirmed these observations, and extended the phenotypic analysis to a large panel of receptors expressed at the NK cell surface. All described NK cells subsets develop normally in vivo in absence of IL-12 and IL-23 stimulation. In particular, we did not detect alterations in the CD56dim or CD56bright circulating NK cells subsets in IL-12RB1-deficient patients, contrasting with a role for IL-12 in the maturation of CD56^{bright} NK cells, suggested earlier by in vitro experiments.42 Furthermore, the repertoire of Ig-like and lectin-like MHC class I receptors did not present any gross abnormalities in IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients. Thus, the variegation at the KIR locus, which is still poorly understood, occurs in an IL-12- and IL-23-independent manner. A defect in NK cell IFN-y production was also reported in the pioneering description of one IL-12RB1deficient patient.²¹ The high variability of NK cell reactivity in vitro, combined with the large variations in peripheral NK cell counts, prompted us to complete this first characterization, by increasing the number of patients and the number of tumor cell targets, and by using single NK cell assays. We confirmed in these 4-hour short-term stimulation protocols, the low IFN- γ production by NK cells from IL-12RB1-deficient patients in response to the prototypical MHC class I⁻ K562 tumor cells. We also showed a trend toward a broader hyporesponsiveness of NK cells for IFN-y production and for cytotoxicity to a lesser extent to various human tumors as well as to antibody-coated target cells. This phenotype was recapitulated with NK cells from an IL-12p40-deficient patient and complemented with exogenous IL-12. Consistent with an earlier report,43 we did not detect much impact of IL-23 of NK cell effector function in vitro, suggesting, but not formally proving, that IL-12 and not IL-23 was responsible for the weak reactivity of NK cells from IL-12R β 1– and IL-12p40–deficient patients. Recent data in humans and mice point to a reappraisal of the "natural" effector function of NK cells. In mice, IL-15 and MHC class I participate in the acquisition of the full spectrum of NK cell reactivity.^{7,9-13} Thus, NK cells do not distinguish themselves from classical T and B cells by their naturally occurring reactivity with targets, but rather by the presence of a substantial fraction of primed and broadly reactive NK cells in the circulation. Yet, the factors that contribute to NK cell priming in vivo may vary between humans and mice. Indeed, we showed here that IL-12/23 is one of the NK cell priming factors in humans. In contrast, IL-12 was recently shown to be redundant for mouse NK cell priming,⁹ despite the moderate but detectable defect in NK cell antitumor cytolytic activity detected in *Il-12–* (data not shown), *Il-12rb1–*, or *Il-12rb2–*deficient mice.⁴⁴⁻⁴⁸

The size of the subset of T cells expressing surface CD56 was drastically reduced in IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients. Much confusion exists regarding the characterization and the function of the subsets of T cells that share phenotypic similarities with NK cells.^{35,49} In particular, CD56⁺ T cells have been too often referred as to NKT cells. There is, however, a consensus defining NKT cells as a subset of CD4⁺ or CD4⁻CD8⁻ T cells that express invariant TCRs, such as CD1d-restricted V α 24 T cells in humans, CD1-restricted Va14 T cells in mice, or MR1-restricted mucosal associated invariant T (MAIT) in both species.^{50,51} CD56⁺ T cells are clearly different from aforementioned invariant NKT cells, as they are mainly $CD8^+TCR\alpha\beta^+$ cells with a high cytolytic potential in absence of in vitro maturation. 37 CD56+TCRa β^+ cells express a diverse TCR repertoire, which tends to oligoclonality, and the size of this subset expands with aging.³⁹ CD56⁺ T cells thus have attributes of effector memory CD8 T cells, although the precise steps of differentiation of CD56+ T cells from naive CD8 T cells are still unknown. In vitro data have argued for a role for IL-12 in their development and/or expansion,52-55 but one report disputed the

in vivo relevance of these findings for the pool of hepatic CD56⁺ T cells.⁵⁵ We also previously showed that most CD56⁺ T cells constitutively express IL-12R β 1.⁵⁶ Similarly, IL-12 priming during primary antigenic challenge increased the population of memory CD8⁺ T cells in mice.^{57,58} Our data unambiguously show that IL-12/23 is required for the maturation of CD8+ T cells into circulating CD8+CD56+ T cells and/or for the maintenance of the latter in vivo in PBMCs in humans. Although IL-12/23 plays a necessary role in the determination of the size of CD56⁺ T cells, it is not sufficient. Indeed, addition of IL-12 in vitro did not lead to the induction or expansion of CD56⁺ T cells (data not shown), consistent with results obtained from the monitoring of IL-12-treated patients.⁵⁹ Along this line, TCR, IL-2, and/or IL-15 stimulations have been show to be involved in the induction/maintenance of CD56⁺ T cells.^{55,60-62} Altogether, the presence of CD56⁺ T cells correlates with several conditions of chronic inflammation such as celiac disease63 or melanoma.64 In cirrhotic livers, a decreased number of CD56⁺ T cells may be related to their susceptibility to hepatocellular carcinoma.65

Although we favor the possibility that IL-12/23 acts directly on NK cells and CD56⁺ T cells, the effect of IL-12/23 deficiency might be indirect (ie, function through a different cell type as opposed to directly these lymphocytes). Irrespective of this possibility, IL-12/23 is involved in the priming of NK cell effector function and in the differentiation and/or the maintenance of CD56⁺ effector memory T cells. The IL-12/IFN- γ axis is a critical molecular pathway in the susceptibility of mycobacteriosis and salmonellosis. Yet, the precise identification of the cells that produce protective IFN- γ in vivo in response to IL-12 during natural Mycobacterium or Salmonella infection in human is still lacking. In the case of Mycobacterium, the in vitro production of IFN- γ by whole blood cells upon live BCG stimulation is shown to be specific and sensitive to identify disease-causing genes in MSMD patients. Importantly, IFN-y production by whole blood upon live BCG stimulation was abrogated in patients lacking NK cells or NK and T cells.32 In the same study, the production of IFN- γ by whole blood from IL-12p40- and IL-12RB1-deficient patients is abolished or severely reduced, respectively.32 Taken together with the strong genetic epidemiologic data showing that IFN- γ /IL-12/23 axis is critical for the protection against Mycobacterium and Salmonella in vivo in humans,30 these results indicate that NK cells and T cells are the source of IFN-y and that IL-12p40 and IL-12Rβ1 are required for this production. In the case of Salmonella, NK and CD56⁺ T cells produce IFN- γ in response to Salmonella typhimurium-infected macrophages in vitro (N. Lapaque and J. Trowsdale, personal communication, December 17, 2007). Although the NK cell hyporesponsiveness observed in IL-12/23 axis-deficient patients is moderate, the biologic consequences of this defect should not be hastily underestimated. A quantitative difference in NK cell reactivity in vitro might be translated in vivo by a delay in the early control of microbial replication and/or in the arming of the immune response (eg, myeloid cell activation as well as T- and B-cell activation by IFN-y production). In such a situation of competition between the onset of the immune response and the development of an aggression, the consequences of a reduction and/or a postponement of the NK cell response might be more severe that intuitively thought. Moreover, the clinical consequences might be limited to certain disease conditions. For instance, MHC class I deficiency in mice leads to a targeted deficit in the rejection of MHC class I⁻ tumors or hematopoietic grafts, but does not compromise the ability of NK cells to keep in check MCMV infections.⁶⁶ However, the potential role for mouse NK cells in the control of *M* tuberculosis in $vivo^{43}$ is disputed.⁶⁷ Furthermore, the rare cases of true NK cell-selective deficiencies do not advocate for a role of NK cells in MSMD. No mycobacteriosis nor salmonellosis has been described in these patients, although mouse NK cells have been recently reported to control Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium infections.⁶⁸ The recent description of 4 children with a novel primary NK cell immunodeficiency rather showed that these patients developed Epstein-Barr virus-driven lymphoproliferative disorder or severe respiratory illnesses of probable viral etiology.⁶⁹ Other clinical reports are also consistent with a role of NK cells in defense against human herpesviral infection.⁷⁰ By contrast, few studies have analyzed the impact of CD56+ T cells during Mycobacterium or Salmonella infections, but the size of this T-cell subset in PBMCs is increased in both conditions.71,72 In the presence of live BCG and Salmonella typhimuriuminfected macrophages in vitro, CD56⁺ T cells, but not CD56⁻ T cells, appear to produce IFN- γ in absence of TCR stimulation. Thus, consistent with other reports on mouse memory CD8 T-cell subsets, a major functional feature of the subset of CD56⁺ T cells resides in their "NK-like" effector functions.73 Interestingly, high counts of circulating CD56+ T cells at diagnosis of pulmonary tuberculosis correlated significantly with negative sputum culture after 8 weeks of treatment.⁷⁴ Taken together with their expansion in a limited set of inflammatory conditions and their high effector potential (both IFN- γ production and cytotoxicity), these data pave the way to dissect whether NK-like CD56⁺ T cells might be critical players in the protective IL-12/23/IFN-y-dependent immune response against Mycobacterium and Salmonella in humans.

Acknowledgments

The authors thank Nicolas Lapaque and John Trowsdale (Cambridge) for sharing unpublished results, and Corinne Beziers-Lafosse (CIML) for her help in the illustrations.

This work was supported by Inserm, CNRS, the European Community ("ALLOSTEM," E.V.), Ligue Nationale contre le Cancer ("Equipe labellisée La Ligue"), the Agence Nationale de la Recherche ("Réseau Innovation Biotechnologies" and "Microbiologie Immunologie–Maladies Emergentes"), Institut National du Cancer, Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche, and Institut Universitaire de France.

Authorship

Contribution: S.G., C.C., J.-L.C., and E.V. designed the experiments and wrote the paper; M.S.T. and L.B. performed experiments in mice (data not shown); L.deB., E.J., C.F., J.F., O.F.-S., Y.C., J.L., J.-L.S., C.B., S.A.J., and S.A.-H. collected patient materials; and L.A. performed statistical analysis.

Conflict-of-interest disclosure: E.V. is a founder and shareholder of Innate-Pharma. All other authors declare no competing financial interests.

Correspondence: Eric Vivier, Centre d'Immunologie de Marseille-Luminy, Case 906, 13288 Marseille cedex 9, France; e-mail: vivier@ciml.univ-mrs.fr.

References

- Moretta A, Bottino C, Mingari MC, Biassoni R, Moretta L. What is a natural killer cell? Nat Immunol. 2002;3:6-8.
- Raulet DH. Interplay of natural killer cells and their receptors with the adaptive immune response. Nat Immunol. 2004;5:996-1002.
- Smyth MJ, Hayakawa Y, Takeda K, Yagita H. New aspects of natural-killer-cell surveillance and therapy of cancer. Nat Rev Cancer. 2002;2: 850-861.
- Lodoen MB, Lanier LL. Natural killer cells as an initial defense against pathogens. Curr Opin Immunol. 2006;18:391-398.
- Newman KC, Riley EM. Whatever turns you on: accessory-cell-dependent activation of NK cells by pathogens. Nat Rev Immunol. 2007;7:279-291.
- Loh J, Chu DT, O'Guin AK, Yokoyama WM, Virgin HW. Natural killer cells utilize both perforin and gamma interferon to regulate murine cytomegalovirus infection in the spleen and liver. J Virol. 2005;79:661-667.
- Anfossi N, Andre P, Guia S, et al. Human NK cell education by inhibitory receptors for MHC class I. Immunity. 2006;25:331-342.
- Bryceson YT, March ME, Ljunggren HG, Long EO. Synergy among receptors on resting NK cells for the activation of natural cytotoxicity and cytokine secretion. Blood. 2006;107:159-166.
- Lucas M, Schachterle W, Oberle K, Aichele P, Diefenbach A. Dendritic cells prime natural killer cells by trans-presenting interleukin 15. Immunity. 2007;26:503-517.
- Yokoyama WM, Kim S. How do natural killer cells find self to achieve tolerance? Immunity. 2006;24: 249-257.
- 11. Raulet DH, Vance RE. Self-tolerance of natural killer cells. Nat Rev Immunol. 2006;6:520-531.
- 12. Vivier E. What is natural in natural killer cells? Immunol Lett. 2006;107:1-7.
- 13. Long EO. Ready for prime time: NK cell priming by dendritic cells. Immunity. 2007;26:385-387.
- Yokoyama WM, Kim S. Licensing of natural killer cells by self-major histocompatibility complex class I. Immunol Rev. 2006;214:143-154.
- 15. Yokoyama WM. Natural killer cell immune responses. Immunol Res. 2005;32:317-326.
- Kobayashi M, Fitz L, Ryan M, et al. Identification and purification of natural killer cell stimulatory factor (NKSF), a cytokine with multiple biologic effects on human lymphocytes. J Exp Med. 1989; 170:827-845.
- Stern AS, Podlaski FJ, Hulmes JD, et al. Purification to homogeneity and partial characterization of cytotoxic lymphocyte maturation factor from human B-lymphoblastoid cells. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 1990;87:6808-6812.
- Fehniger TA, Shah MH, Turner MJ, et al. Differential cytokine and chemokine gene expression by human NK cells following activation with IL-18 or IL-15 in combination with IL-12: implications for the innate immune response. J Immunol. 1999; 162:4511-4520.
- Walzer T, Dalod M, Robbins SH, Zitvogel L, Vivier E. Natural-killer cells and dendritic cells: "l'union fait la force." Blood. 2005;106:2252-2258.
- Orange JS, Biron CA. An absolute and restricted requirement for IL-12 in natural killer cell IFN-γ production and antiviral defense. J Immunol. 1997;156:1138-1142.
- Altare F, Lammas D, Revy P, et al. Inherited interleukin 12 deficiency in a child with bacille Calmette-Guerin and Salmonella enteritidis disseminated infection. J Clin Invest. 1998;102: 2035-2040.
- 22. Ferlazzo G, Pack M, Thomas D, et al. Distinct

roles of IL-12 and IL-15 in human natural killer cell activation by dendritic cells from secondary lymphoid organs. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2004; 101:16606-16611.

- Gerosa F, Gobbi A, Zorzi P, et al. The reciprocal interaction of NK cells with plasmacytoid or myeloid dendritic cells profoundly affects innate resistance functions. J Immunol. 2005;174:727-734.
- Trinchieri G, Pflanz S, Kastelein RA. The IL-12 family of heterodimeric cytokines: new players in the regulation of T cell responses. Immunity. 2003;19:641-644.
- Trinchieri G. Interleukin-12 and the regulation of innate resistance and adaptive immunity. Nat Rev Immunol. 2003;3:133-146.
- Fieschi C, Casanova JL. The role of interleukin-12 in human infectious diseases: only a faint signature. Eur J Immunol. 2003;33:1461-1464.
- Fieschi C, Dupuis S, Catherinot E, et al. Low penetrance, broad resistance, and favorable outcome of interleukin 12 receptor beta1 deficiency: medical and immunological implications. J Exp Med. 2003;197:527-535.
- Quintana-Murci L, Alcais A, Abel L, Casanova JL. Immunology in natura: clinical, epidemiological and evolutionary genetics of infectious diseases. Nat Immunol. 2007;8:1165-1171.
- Casanova JL, Abel L. Primary immunodeficiencies: a field in its infancy. Science. 2007;317:617-619.
- Casanova JL, Abel L. Genetic dissection of immunity to mycobacteria: the human model. Annu Rev Immunol. 2002;20:581-620.
- Picard C, Fieschi C, Altare F, et al. Inherited interleukin-12 deficiency: IL12B genotype and clinical phenotype of 13 patients from six kindreds. Am J Hum Genet. 2002;70:336-348.
- Feinberg J, Fieschi C, Doffinger R, et al. Bacillus Calmette Guerin triggers the IL-12/IFN-gamma axis by an IRAK-4- and NEMO-dependent, noncognate interaction between monocytes, NK, and T lymphocytes. Eur J Immunol. 2004;34:3276-3284.
- Ferlazzo G, Munz C. NK cell compartments and their activation by dendritic cells. J Immunol. 2004;172:1333-1339.
- Cooper MA, Fehniger TA, Caligiuri MA. The biology of human natural killer-cell subsets. Trends Immunol. 2001;22:633-640.
- Vivier E, Anfossi N. Inhibitory NK-cell receptors on T cells: witness of the past, actors of the future. Nat Rev Immunol. 2004;4:190-198.
- Ohkawa T, Seki S, Dobashi H, et al. Systematic characterization of human CD8+ T cells with natural killer cell markers in comparison with natural killer cells and normal CD8+ T cells. Immunology. 2001;103:281-290.
- Pittet MJ, Speiser DE, Valmori D, Cerottini JC, Romero P. Cutting edge: cytolytic effector function in human circulating CD8⁺ T cells closely correlates with CD56 surface expression. J Immunol. 2000;164:1148-1152.
- Stewart CA, Walzer T, Robbins SH, Malissen B, Vivier E, Prinz I. Germ-line and rearranged Tcrd transcription distinguish bona fide NK cells and NK-like gammadelta T cells. Eur J Immunol. 2007;37:1442-1452.
- Lutz CT, Moore MB, Bradley S, Shelton BJ, Lutgendorf SK. Reciprocal age related change in natural killer cell receptors for MHC class I. Mech Ageing Dev. 2005;126:722-731.
- Gately MK, Renzetti LM, Magram J, et al. The interleukin-12/interleukin-12-receptor system: role in normal and pathologic immune responses. Annu Rev Immunol. 1998;16:495-521.
- 41. de Jong R, Altare F, Haagen IA, et al. Severe mycobacterial and Salmonella infections in interleu-

kin-12 receptor-deficient patients. Science. 1998; 280:1435-1438.

- Loza MJ, Perussia B. The IL-12 signature: NK cell terminal CD56+high stage and effector functions. J Immunol. 2004;172:88-96.
- Feng CG, Kaviratne M, Rothfuchs AG, et al. NK cell-derived IFN-{gamma} differentially regulates innate resistance and neutrophil response in T cell-deficient hosts infected with Mycobacterium tuberculosis. J Immunol. 2006;177:7086-7093.
- Magram J, Connaughton SE, Warrier RR, et al. IL-12-deficient mice are defective in IFN gamma production and type 1 cytokine responses. Immunity. 1996;4:471-481.
- Wu C, Ferrante J, Gately MK, Magram J. Characterization of IL-12 receptor beta1 chain (IL-12Rbeta1)-deficient mice: IL-12Rbeta1 is an essential component of the functional mouse IL-12 receptor. J Immunol. 1997;159:1658-1665.
- Takeda K, Tsutsui H, Yoshimoto T, et al. Defective NK cell activity and Th1 response in IL-18deficient mice. Immunity. 1998;8:383-390.
- Wu C, Wang X, Gadina M, O'Shea JJ, Presky DH, Magram J. IL-12 receptor ss2 (IL-12Rss2)deficient mice are defective in IL-12-mediated signaling despite the presence of high affinity IL-12 binding sites. J Immunol. 2000;165:6221-6228.
- Grufman P, Karre K. Innate and adaptive immunity to tumors: IL-12 is required for optimal responses. Eur J Immunol. 2000;30:1088-1093.
- Anfossi N, Pascal V, Vivier E, Ugolini S. Biology of T memory type 1 cells. Immunol Rev. 2001; 181:269-278.
- 50. Treiner E, Lantz O. CD1d- and MR1-restricted invariant T cells: of mice and men. Curr Opin Immunol. 2006;18:519-526.
- 51. Bendelac A, Savage PB, Teyton L. The biology of NKT cells. Annu Rev Immunol. 2007;25:297-336.
- Zoll B, Lefterova P, Ebert O, Huhn D, Von Ruecker A, Schmidt-Wolf IG. Modulation of cell surface markers on NK-like T lymphocytes by using IL-2, IL-7 or IL-12 in vitro stimulation. Cytokine. 2000;12:1385-1390.
- Lopez RD, Waller EK, Lu PH, Negrin RS. CD58/ LFA-3 and IL-12 provided by activated monocytes are critical in the in vitro expansion of CD56+ T cells. Cancer Immunol Immunother. 2001;49:629-640.
- Lin SJ, Chao HC, Yan DC. Phenotypic changes of T-lymphocyte subsets induced by interleukin-12 and interleukin-15 in umbilical cord vs. adult peripheral blood mononuclear cells. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. 2001;12:21-26.
- Kelly AM, Golden-Mason L, McEntee G, et al. Interleukin 12 (IL-12) is increased in tumour bearing human liver and expands CD8(+) and CD56(+) T cells in vitro but not in vivo. Cytokine. 2004;25: 273-282.
- Guia S, Vivier E, André P. Phenotypic characterization of C56dim/CD56bright NK-cell subsets and IL-2-dependent human NK-cell lines. In: Mason D, ed. 7th HLDA. New York, NY: Oxford University Press; 2001:428-430.
- Chang J, Cho JH, Lee SW, Choi SY, Ha SJ, Sung YC. IL-12 priming during in vitro antigenic stimulation changes properties of CD8 T cells and increases generation of effector and memory cells. J Immunol. 2004;172:2818-2826.
- Lee JB, Lee KA, Chang J. Phenotypic changes induced by IL-12 priming regulate effector and memory CD8 T cell differentiation. Int Immunol. 2007;19:1039-1048.
- Gollob JA, Schnipper CP, Orsini E, et al. Characterization of a novel subset of CD8(+) T cells that expands in patients receiving interleukin-12. J Clin Invest. 1998;102:561-575.

- Thulesen S, Nissen MH, Odum N, Ropke C. Induction of cytotoxic CD8+CD56+ T cells from human thymocytes by interleukin-15. J Interferon Cytokine Res. 2001;21:905-911.
- Jin Y, Fuller L, Carreno M, Esquenazi V, Tzakis AG, Miller J. The regulation of phenotype and function of human liver CD3+/CD56+ lymphocytes, and cells that also co-express CD8 by IL-2, IL-12 and anti-CD3 monoclonal antibody. Hum Immunol. 1998;59:352-362.
- Satoh M, Seki S, Hashimoto W, et al. Cytotoxic gammadelta or alphabeta T cells with a natural killer cell marker, CD56, induced from human peripheral blood lymphocytes by a combination of IL-12 and IL-2. J Immunol. 1996;157:3886-3892.
- Meresse B, Curran SA, Ciszewski C, et al. Reprogramming of CTLs into natural killer-like cells in celiac disease. J Exp Med. 2006;203:1343-1355.
- Casado JG, Soto R, DelaRosa O, et al. CD8 T cells expressing NK associated receptors are increased in melanoma patients and display an effector phenotype. Cancer Immunol Immunother. 2005;54:1162-1171.

- Kawarabayashi N, Seki S, Hatsuse K, et al. Decrease of CD56(+)T cells and natural killer cells in cirrhotic livers with hepatitis C may be involved in their susceptibility to hepatocellular carcinoma. Hepatology. 2000;32:962-969.
- Tay CH, Welsh RM, Brutkiewicz RR. NK cell response to viral infections in beta 2-microglobulindeficient mice. J Immunol. 1995;154:780-789.
- Junqueira-Kipnis AP, Kipnis A, Jamieson A, et al. NK cells respond to pulmonary infection with Mycobacterium tuberculosis, but play a minimal role in protection. J Immunol. 2003;171:6039-6045.
- Harrington L, Srikanth CV, Antony R, Shi HN, Cherayil BJ. A role for natural killer cells in intestinal inflammation caused by infection with Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium. FEMS Immunol Med Microbiol. 2007;51:372-380.
- Eidenschenk C, Dunne J, Jouanguy E, et al. A novel primary immunodeficiency with specific natural-killer cell deficiency maps to the centromeric region of chromosome 8. Am J Hum Genet. 2006;78:721-727.

- Orange JS. Human natural killer cell deficiencies. Curr Opin Allergy Clin Immunol. 2006;6: 399-409.
- Jason J, Buchanan I, Archibald LK, et al. Natural T, gammadelta, and NK cells in mycobacterial, Salmonella, and human immunodeficiency virus infections. J Infect Dis. 2000;182:474-481.
- Barcelos W, Martins-Filho OA, Guimaraes TM, et al. Peripheral blood mononuclear cells immunophenotyping in pulmonary tuberculosis patients before and after treatment. Microbiol Immunol. 2006;50:597-605.
- Berg RE, Forman J. The role of CD8 T cells in innate immunity and in antigen non-specific protection. Curr Opin Immunol. 2006;18:338-343.
- Veenstra H, Baumann R, Carroll NM, et al. Changes in leucocyte and lymphocyte subsets during tuberculosis treatment; prominence of CD3dimCD56+ natural killer T cells in fast treatment responders. Clin Exp Immunol. 2006;145: 252-260.